





ROYAL INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY

### What are moment problems and why are they useful in systems and control?

Anders Lindquist Royal Institute of Technology (KTH) Stockholm, Sweden

Semi-Plenary Lecture at the combined 48th IEEE Conference on Decision and Control and 28th Chinese Control Conference, Shanghai, December, 2009.

#### What is the talk about

- A classical problem the moment problem with a decidedly non-classical twist motivated by applications to systems and control.
- What is new are certain rationality constraints imposed by applications that alter the mathematical problem and make it nonlinear.
- A global-analysis approach that studies the class of solutions as a whole.
- A powerful paradigm for smoothly parametrizing, comparing, and shaping solutions to specifications.

### Acknowledgements 1



Christopher Byrnes



Tryphon Georgiou



Sergei Gusev



Giorgio Picci



Michele Pavon



Augusto Ferrante



Alexandre Megretski

Vladimir Yakubovich

### Acknowledgements 2



Per Enqvist



Johan Karlsson



Ryozo Nagamune



Anders Blomqvist



Vanna Fanizza



Enrico Avventi



Yohei Kuroiwa



Francesca Carli

### The moment problem

Given  $c_0, c_1, \ldots, c_n$ , find  $d\mu$  such that

$$\int_a^b \alpha_k(t) \frac{d\mu}{d\mu} = \frac{c_k}{k}, \quad k = 0, 1, \dots, n$$

- Power moment problem:  $\alpha_k(t) = t^k$
- Trigonometric moment problem:  $\alpha_k(t) = e^{ikt}$ ,  $[a,b] = [-\pi,\pi]$
- Nevanlinna-Pick interpolation:  $\alpha_k(t) = \frac{e^{it} + z_k}{e^{it} z_k}$ ,  $[a, b] = [-\pi, \pi]$



Chebyshev



Markov



Lyapunov

## Where do we find moment problems in systems and control?



### Moment problems don't always look like moment problems

Let us look at a few that don't, and return to them throughout the lecture

#### Ex. 1: Covariance extension

•  $c_k = E\{y(t+k)y(t)\}$ , where y stationary stochastic process

**PROBLEM:** Given<br/> $c_0, c_1, \ldots, c_n$  such that $T_n = \begin{bmatrix} c_0 & c_1 & \cdots & c_n \\ \bar{c}_1 & c_0 & \cdots & c_{n-1} \\ \vdots & \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ \bar{c}_n & \bar{c}_{n-1} & \cdots & c_0 \end{bmatrix} > 0$ Find infinite extension  $c_{n+1}, c_{n+2}, \dots$  such that  $T_{\infty} = \begin{bmatrix} c_0 & c_1 & c_2 & \cdots \\ \bar{c}_1 & c_0 & c_1 & \cdots \\ \bar{c}_2 & \bar{c}_1 & c_0 & \cdots \\ \vdots & \vdots & \vdots & \ddots \end{bmatrix} > 0$ 

spectral estimation, speech synthesis, system identification

#### Ex 2: Circulant covariance extension

•  $c_k = E\{y(t+k)y(t)\}$ , where y periodic stochastic process on [0, 2N]

$$c_{2N-k} = c_k, \quad k = 0, 1, \dots, N$$

reciprocal process

(Jamison, Krener, Levy, Frezza, Ferrante, Picci, Pavon, Carli)

**PROBLEM:** Given n < N and  $c_0, c_1, \ldots, c_n$  such that  $T_n > 0$ , find extension  $c_{n+1}, c_{n+2}, \ldots, c_N$  such that

### Ex. 3: Robust control



d

**PROBLEM:** Find an internally stabilizing controller K such that

 $S = (I - GK)^{-1}$ 

has low degree and satisfies the design specifications



S(z

<u>y</u>



### What do we want to achieve?

- A basic paradigm for smooth parameterization of the whole class of solutions in a systems-theoretical language
- Methods for determining solutions by convex optimization

NB. This is a systematic design methodology that is still in progress

### Moment problem in the style of Krein

 $\mathfrak{P}$  finite-dimensional subspace of C[a, b]

 $(\alpha_0, \alpha_1, \ldots, \alpha_n)$  basis in  $\mathfrak{P}$ 

Given 
$$c := (c_0, c_1, \dots, c_n) \in \mathbb{C}^{n+1}$$
,  
find positive measure  $d\mu$  such that  
 $\int_a^b \alpha_k(t) d\mu = c_k, \quad k = 0, 1, \dots, n$ 



$$\mathfrak{P}_+ := \{ p \in \mathfrak{P} \mid P(t) := \operatorname{Re}(p) \ge 0 \quad \forall t \in [a, b] \}$$

positive cone closed convex

Suppose  $\mathfrak{P}_+$  has a nonempty interior  $\overset{\circ}{\mathfrak{P}}_+$ 

$$\mathfrak{M}: \mathcal{M}_{+} \to \mathbb{C}^{n+1}, \quad d\mu \mapsto c = \begin{bmatrix} c_{0} \\ \vdots \\ c_{n} \end{bmatrix} \qquad \begin{array}{c} c_{k} = \int_{a}^{b} \alpha_{k}(t) d\mu \\ \end{array}$$
space of positive measures
$$p \in \mathfrak{P}, \quad p(t) = \sum_{0}^{n} p_{k} \alpha_{k}(t) \qquad P(t) = \operatorname{Re}\{p(t)\} \\ \langle c, p \rangle := \operatorname{Re}\left\{\sum_{k=0}^{n} c_{k} p_{k}\right\} = \int_{a}^{b} P(t) d\mu \ge 0 \quad \forall p \in \mathfrak{P}_{+} \\ \bullet \quad \bullet \quad c \in \mathfrak{C}_{+} \text{ positive sequence} \qquad \bullet \quad \mathfrak{M}(\mathcal{M}_{+}) \subset \mathfrak{C}_{+} \\ \mathfrak{C}_{+} := \left\{c \in \mathbb{C}^{n+1} \mid \langle c, p \rangle \ge 0 \quad \forall p \in \mathfrak{P}_{+}\right\} = (\mathfrak{P}_{+})^{\mathsf{T}} \qquad \begin{array}{c} \operatorname{dual \ cone} \\ \operatorname{closed \ convex} \\ \operatorname{THEOREM}(\operatorname{Krein-Nudelman}) \mathfrak{M}(\mathcal{M}_{+}) = \mathfrak{C}_{+} \end{array}$$

The moment problem is solvable if and only if  $c \in \mathfrak{C}_+$ 

### Dual cones

$$\mathfrak{P}_+ = \{p = \sum_{k=0}^n p_k lpha_k \in \mathfrak{P} \mid \ P(t) = \operatorname{Re}\{p(t)\} \ge 0, \quad a \le t \le b\}$$

positive cone

$$\begin{split} \mathfrak{C}_{+} &= ig\{ c \in \mathbb{C}^{n+1} \mid \langle c, p 
angle \geq 0 \quad \forall p \in \mathfrak{P}_{+} ig\} \ &= (\mathfrak{P}_{+})^{\mathsf{T}} \qquad extbf{positive sequences} \end{split}$$

$$\langle c, p \rangle := \operatorname{Re} \left\{ \sum_{k=0}^{n} c_k p_k \right\}$$



# $\begin{aligned} \mathfrak{P} &= \operatorname{span}\{1, e^{it}, \dots, e^{int}\} \\ [a,b] &= [-\pi,\pi] \\ c &\in \mathfrak{C}_+ \end{aligned} \qquad T_n = \begin{bmatrix} c_0 & c_1 & \cdots & c_n \\ \overline{c}_1 & c_0 & \cdots & c_{n-1} \\ \vdots & \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ \overline{c}_n & \overline{c}_{n-1} & \cdots & c_0 \end{bmatrix} \ge 0 \end{aligned}$

Equivalent formulation:

Given  $c := (c_0, c_1, \ldots, c_n) \in \mathbb{C}^{n+1}$ , find an infinite extension  $c_{n+1}, c_{n+2}, \ldots$  such that

$$f(z) = c_0 + c_1 z + c_2 z^2 + c_3 z^3 + \cdots$$

is positive real (Carathéodory function)



### Spectral estimation as a trigonometric moment problem

white noise 
$$\underbrace{\mathbf{v}}_{W(z)}$$
  $\underbrace{\mathbf{w}}_{W(z)}$   $\underbrace{\mathbf{v}}_{W(z)}$   $\underbrace{\mathbf{v}}_{$ 

### Ex: Modeling speech





on each (30 ms) subinterval w(z) constant, y stationary

observation:  $y_0, y_1, \ldots, y_N$ 

 $N\approx 250$ 

 $P(\theta) = \operatorname{Re}\{p(\theta)\}\$ 

 $Q(\theta) = \operatorname{Re}\{q(\theta)\}$ 

where  $p, q \in \check{\mathfrak{P}}_+$ 

$$\int_{-\pi}^{\pi} e^{ik\theta} d\mu = c_k := \frac{1}{N+1} \sum_{t=0}^{N-k} y_{t+k} y_t, \quad k = 0, 1, \dots, n \quad n = 10$$

 $\mathfrak{P}$  consists of trigonometric polynomials

$$d\mu = \left|w(e^{i\theta})\right|^2 \frac{d\theta}{2\pi} = \frac{P(\theta)}{Q(\theta)}d\theta$$

rational positive measure

Cellular telephone:

$$d\mu = rac{
ho_n}{\left|arphi_n(e^{it})
ight|^2} dt$$

 $\varphi_n(z)$  n:th Szegö polynomial orthogonal on the unit circle

$$P(t) = \rho_n \qquad Q(t) = \left|\varphi_n(e^{it})\right|^2$$

 $\sigma(z)$  stable polynomial spectral factor:  $|\sigma(e^{it})|^2 = P(t)$ 

Is there a solution  $d\mu$  for each choice of spectral zeros? YES (Georgiou 1983)

0

0





envelope

The moment problem for rational measures Byrnes - L **DEF.**  $p \in \mathfrak{P}$ ,  $p = \sum_{k=0}^{n} p_k \alpha_k$  polynomial in  $\mathfrak{P}$  $P = \operatorname{Re}(p)$ P/Q, where  $p, q \in \mathfrak{P}$  real rational function for  $\mathfrak{P}$  $\mathcal{R}_+ = \left\{ d\mu \mid d\mu = rac{P(t)}{O(t)} dt, \ p,q \in \overset{\circ}{\mathfrak{P}}_+ 
ight\} \subset \mathcal{M}_+$ rational positive measure ſb

$$\int_a u_k d\mu = c_k, \quad k = 0, 1, \dots, n \quad (\dagger)$$

Find  $d\mu \in \mathcal{M}_+$  satisfying (†) linear problem Find  $d\mu \in \mathcal{R}_+$  satisfying (†) nonlinear problem

$$\mathring{\mathfrak{C}}_+$$
 interior of  $\mathfrak{C}_+$   $c \in \overset{\circ}{\mathfrak{C}}_+$  strictly positive sequence

From now on we assume that all  $p \in \mathfrak{P}$  are Lipschitz continuous.

THEOREM.  $\mathfrak{M}(\mathcal{R}_+) = \overset{\circ}{\mathfrak{C}_+}$ . In other words, the moment problem for rational measures is solvable if and only if c is strictly positive.

For each 
$$p \in \mathring{\mathfrak{P}}_+$$
, define  
 $\mathcal{P}_+(p) = \{ d\mu \in \mathcal{R}_+ \mid p \in \mathring{\mathfrak{P}}_+ \text{ fixed} \}$ 

THEOREM. For each  $p \in \mathring{\mathfrak{P}}_+$ ,  $\mathfrak{M}(\mathcal{P}_+(p)) = \mathring{\mathfrak{C}}_+$ . In other words, the moment problem for rational measures with fixed  $p \in \mathring{\mathfrak{P}}_+$  is solvable if and only if c is strictly positive.

We want to show that there is a unique solution for each  $p \in \overset{\circ}{\mathfrak{P}}_+$ .

### A Dirichlet principle

For fixed  $p \in \overset{\circ}{\mathfrak{P}}_+$ , consider the moment equations

$$f_k^p(q) := c_k - \int_a^b \alpha_k \frac{P}{Q} dt = 0, \quad k = 0, 1, \dots, n,$$

where  $f^p: \overset{\circ}{\mathfrak{P}}_+ \to \overset{\circ}{\mathfrak{C}}_+.$ 

Dirichlet Principle:  $f_k^p(q) = 0, \ k = 0, 1, \dots, n$  are the critical point equations for some smooth function  $\mathbb{J}_p : \overset{\circ}{\mathfrak{P}}_+ \to \mathbb{R}$ , which has a unique minimum and no other critical points.

Define a 1-form on 
$$\overset{\circ}{\mathfrak{P}}_+$$
:  $\omega = \operatorname{Re}\left\{\sum_{k=0}^n f_k^p(q) dq_k\right\}$ 

$$\omega = \operatorname{Re} \sum_{k=0}^{n} c_k dq_k - \int_a^b \frac{P}{Q} dQ dt \qquad \qquad \overset{\circ}{\mathfrak{P}}_+ \text{ open} \\ \text{ and convex} \\ d\omega = \int_a^b \frac{P}{Q^2} dQ \wedge dQ dt = 0 \qquad \qquad \omega \text{ closed} \qquad \qquad \qquad \omega \text{ exact}$$

By the Poincaré Lemma, we can integrate along any curve:

$$\mathbb{J}_p(q_1) := \int_{q_0}^{q_1} \left( \operatorname{Re} \sum_{k=0}^n c_k dq_k - \int_a^b \frac{P}{Q} dQ dt \right) \quad \Longrightarrow$$

$$\mathbb{J}_p(q) = \langle c, q \rangle - \int_a^b P \log Q \, dt$$

(modulo a constant of integration)

• This is a strictly convex functional

$$\mathbb{J}_p(q) = \langle c,q\rangle - \int_a^b P\log Q\,dt$$

strictly convex function  $\mathbb{J}_p: \stackrel{\circ}{\mathfrak{P}_+} \to \mathbb{R}$ 

Moment equations:

$$\frac{\partial \mathbb{J}_p}{\partial q_k} = c_k - \int_a^b u_k \frac{P}{Q} dt = 0, \quad k = 0, 1, \dots, n \quad (\dagger)$$

We have already shown that the moment equations (†) have a solution  $\hat{q} \in \overset{\circ}{\mathfrak{P}}_+$  for all  $(c, p) \in \overset{\circ}{\mathfrak{C}}_+ \times \overset{\circ}{\mathfrak{P}}_+$ . Since  $\mathbb{J}_p$  is strictly convex,  $\hat{q}$  is a unique minimum. Hence (†) has a unique solution.

**THEOREM.** Let  $(c, p) \in \mathfrak{C}_+ \times \mathfrak{P}_+$ , and set  $P := Re\{p\}$ . Then the functional  $\mathbb{J}_p$  has a unique minimizer  $\hat{q} \in \mathfrak{P}_+$ : the unique solution of the moment equations (†). If  $p \in \mathfrak{P}_+$ , then  $\hat{q} \in \mathfrak{P}_+$ .

### A global analysis approach

**Object:** Finding a solution that best satisfies additional design specifications (without increasing the complexity)



**EXAMPLE.**  $\mathfrak{P} = \operatorname{span}\{1, e^{it}, \dots, e^{int}\}\$ 

The solutions  $d\mu \in \mathcal{R}_+$  form a manifold of dimension 2n.

A foliation with one leaf for each choice of  $p \in \overset{\circ}{\mathfrak{P}}_+$  (Kalman filtering)

A foliation with one leaf for each choice of  $c \in \overset{\circ}{\mathfrak{C}}_+$  (normalized)

**THEOREM.** The two foliations intersect transversely so that each leaf in one meets each leaf in the other in exactly one point.

![](_page_25_Figure_5.jpeg)

Primal problemspectral  
zeros(P) 
$$\mathbb{I}_p(\Phi) = \int_a^b P \log \Phi dt \to \max$$
  
subject to  $\int_a^b u_k \Phi dt = c_k, \quad k \neq 0, 1, \dots, n$ Lagrange  
multipliersTHEOREM. (P) has a unique solution  
 $\Phi = \frac{P}{Q}, \quad Q := \operatorname{Re}\{\hat{q}\},$   
where  $\hat{q} \in \mathfrak{P}_+$  is the unique minimizer of  $\mathbb{J}_p$ .Dual problem:  
 $\min_{q \in \mathfrak{P}_+} \mathbb{J}_p(q)$ 

Alternative cost function:

$$\mathbb{D}(P\|\Phi) = \int_a^b P\log\frac{P}{\Phi}dt \to \min$$

solution for P = 1Kullback-Leibler divergence

**Circulant covariance extension**  $c_{2N-k} = c_k, \quad k \le N$  $\mathfrak{P}_+(N) = \{ p \in \mathfrak{P} \mid P(e^{ik\pi/N}) > 0, \ k = 0, 1, \dots, 2N \} \supset \mathfrak{P}_+$  $\mathfrak{C}_+(N) \to \mathfrak{C}_+ \text{ as } N \to \infty$  $\mathfrak{C}_+(N) = \mathfrak{P}_+(N)^\mathsf{T} \subset \mathfrak{C}_+$ sum of Dirac  $\mathcal{R}(N) = \{ d\mu \in \mathcal{M}_+ \mid d\mu = rac{P}{O} d
u, \ p,q \in \mathfrak{P}_+(N)$ measures PROBLEM. Given  $c_0, c_1, \ldots, c_n$ (n < N) find  $d\mu \in \mathcal{R}(N)$  such that  $\int_{-\infty}^{\pi} e^{ikt} d\mu = c_k, \ k = 0, 1, \dots, n \quad (\dagger)$  $\frac{\pi}{N}$  $2\pi$ For each  $(c, p) \in \mathfrak{C}_+(N) \times \mathfrak{P}_+(N)$ , there is a unique  $q \in \mathfrak{P}_+(N)$  such that  $(\dagger)$  $\mathbb{J}_p(q) = \langle c, q \rangle - \int^{\infty} P \log Q \ d
u$ holds. It is the unique minimizer of

### Image processing

y(t) reciprocal *m*-vector process

$$c_k = E\{y(t+k)y(t)^{\mathsf{T}}\} \quad m \times m$$

$$c_{2N-k} = c_k^\mathsf{T}, \quad k \leq N$$

For scalar P there is a matrix version of

$$\mathbb{J}_p(q) = \langle c,q 
angle - \int_{-\pi}^{\pi} P \log Q \; d
u$$

m 1 1 2Ny(0) y(1) y(2N-1)

Francesca Carli, Augusto Ferrante, Michele Pavon, and Giorgio Picci reconstructions with P = 1(maximum entropy) and n = 1(m = 125, 2N - 1 = 175)

### original below

![](_page_28_Picture_9.jpeg)

### A tunable high resolution spectral estimator (THREE)

Zoom into a selected spectral band by moving interpolation points from the origin closer to the unit circle.

![](_page_30_Figure_2.jpeg)

Byrnes-

Georgiou-

0

0

Two sets of tuning parameters: • filter bank poles • spectral zeros (P)

![](_page_31_Figure_0.jpeg)

### Loop shaping in robust control

![](_page_32_Figure_1.jpeg)

![](_page_32_Figure_2.jpeg)

$$S = (1 - GK)^{-1}$$

Sensitivity function

• Internal stability requires

S analytic in 
$$\mathbb{D}^c := \{ z \mid |z| > 1 \}$$

 $S(z_k) = 0$  at all unstable poles of G

 $S(z_j) = 1$  at all zeros of G in  $\mathbb{D}^c$ 

• Disturbance attenuation requires

 $\|S\|_{\infty} \leq \gamma$ 

• We want  $\deg S$  to be small

There is a minimum bound  $\gamma_{\text{opt}}$  but we choose  $\gamma > \gamma_{\text{opt}}$  and define  $f(z) := \frac{1}{\gamma} S(z^{-1})$ 

![](_page_32_Figure_13.jpeg)

Nevanlinna-Pick interpolation for Schur functions

$$f(z_k) = w_k, \quad k = 0, 1, \dots, n$$

![](_page_33_Picture_2.jpeg)

class of Schur functions  $\ensuremath{\mathbb{S}}$ 

The interpolants of degree at most n are parameterized by the  $p \in \mathfrak{P}_+$  in a 1-1 fashion

$$\begin{array}{l} \max_{f \in \mathbb{S}} \mathbb{K}_p(f) \\ \text{subject to } f(z_k) = c_k, \quad k = 0, 1, \dots, n \end{array} \begin{array}{l} \text{has unique} \\ \text{solution } \hat{f} \\ \hline F: \ p \mapsto \hat{f} \end{array} \\ \text{where} \quad \mathbb{K}_p(f) = \int_{-\pi}^{\pi} P \log \left(1 - |f(e^{it})|^2\right) dt \end{array} \begin{array}{l} \text{has unique} \\ \text{solution } \hat{f} \\ \hline F: \ p \mapsto \hat{f} \\ \text{deg } \hat{f} \leq n \end{array}$$

![](_page_34_Figure_0.jpeg)

### Shaping by model reduction

 $F: \ p \mapsto f$  unique interpolant maximizing of  $\mathbb{K}_p$ 

Karlsson -Georgiou - L

interpolant of high or infinite degree but with |g| of desired shape

> difficult approximation problem

interpolant of degree at most n + m with a shape close to that of g

![](_page_35_Figure_6.jpeg)

![](_page_36_Figure_0.jpeg)

### A generalization of THREE

stationary process 
$$y$$
  
spectral density  $\Phi$   $G(z)$   $G(z)$   $G(z) = (I - zA)^{-1}B$   $E\{x(t)x(t)^{\mathsf{T}}\} = \Sigma$ 

$$\begin{array}{ll} \textbf{(P)} & \min_{\Phi \in C_{+}} \mathbb{D}(P \| \Phi) & \text{subject to } \int_{-\pi}^{\pi} G \Phi G^{*} d\theta = \Sigma \\ & \text{where } \mathbb{D}(P \| \Phi) = \int_{-\pi}^{\pi} P \log \frac{P}{\Phi} dt & \begin{array}{c} \text{Kullback-Leibler} \\ & \begin{array}{c} \text{divergence} \end{array} \end{array} \\ \hline \textbf{(D)} & \min_{\Lambda \in \mathcal{L}_{+}} \mathbb{J}_{p}(\Lambda) & \text{where } \mathbb{J}_{p}(\Lambda) = \operatorname{tr}(\Sigma \Lambda) - \int_{-\pi}^{\pi} P \log G^{*} \Lambda G \, d\theta \\ & \begin{array}{c} \mathcal{L}_{+} = \{\Lambda \in \operatorname{range} \Gamma \mid Q := G^{*} \Lambda G > 0\} & \text{where } \Gamma : \ \Phi \mapsto \Sigma \end{array} \end{array}$$

### Multi-variable case

$$\mathbb{D}(P \| \Phi) = \int_{-\pi}^{\pi} \operatorname{tr} \left( P(\log P - \log \Phi) \right) d\theta$$

works well in the multi-variable case for scalar P

von Neumann's generalization of Kullback-Leibler divergence

Ferrante, Pavon and Ramponi have suggested replacing  $\mathbb{D}(P \| \Phi)$  by the Hellinger distance:

 $d_H(\Phi, P) = \inf \{ \|W_P - W_\Phi\|_2 \mid W_P W_P^* = P, \ W_\Phi W_\Phi^* = \Phi \}$ 

![](_page_38_Figure_6.jpeg)

### Some other problems

• Prediction-error approximation

Given spectral density  $\Phi$ , find approximant  $\hat{\Phi}$  in the model class  $\hat{\Phi} = Q^{-1}$ , where  $q \in \mathfrak{P}_+$ .

Blomqvist - Wahlberg

$$\int_{-\pi}^{\pi} \left(\Phi Q - \log Q\right) d heta o \min$$
  
 $\mathbb{J}_1(q) = \langle c, q 
angle - \int_{-\pi}^{\pi} \log Q d heta$   
where  $c_k = \int e^{ik heta} \Phi d heta$ 

prefiltering for nontrivial  ${\cal P}$ 

Covariance and cepstral matching
 Given c<sub>0</sub>, c<sub>1</sub>, ..., c<sub>n</sub> and σ<sub>1</sub>, ... σ<sub>n</sub>,
 find p, q ∈ 𝒫<sub>+</sub> such that
 Byrnes - Enqvist - L, Enqvist,
 Georgiou - L, Avventi - Enqvist

$$\int_{-\pi}^{\pi} e^{ik\theta} \frac{P}{Q} d\theta = c_k$$
$$\int_{-\pi}^{\pi} e^{ik\theta} \log \frac{P}{Q} d\theta = \sigma_k$$

• Operator Theory Byrnes - Georgiou - Lindquist - Megretski

### Conclusions

An enhanced theory for generalized moment problems that incorporates rationality constraints prescribed by applications.

- Complete parameterizations of solutions with smooth tuning strategies.
- A global analysis approach that studies the class of solutions as a whole.
- Convex optimization for determining solutions.